*Subject to change*

**CCPX 4038-002: Comparative Psychotherapies**

3.0 credits

Autumn 2022

Thursdays, 9am-10:40am EST

In-person only

Instructor: Venus Mahmoodi, PhD

E-mail: vm2607@tc.columbia.edu

Office Hours: Thursdays – 8:30-9am or 10:45-11:15am; Friday 9am (via Zoom or Midtown); by appointment only, email to schedule.

**Course Description:**

This course will utilize history, theory, research, and classroom discussion to help students understand fundamental components of psychotherapy and what makes a psychotherapeutical modality effective in treating a variety of disorders, including depression, anxiety, and life transitions. The major models of psychotherapy, Psychodynamic, Existential, Behavioral, and Cognitive, are introduced using theory, self-reflection, demonstrations, and videos. This course will take a deeper dive in issues of diversity, multicultural techniques, the importance of cultural competence, and consider identity in the therapeutic space.

**Learning Objectives:**

* Current principles and practices of 4 different psychotherapy approaches
* Issue specific outcome research related to each approach
* Case conceptualization and creating treatment plans
* Comparison of varied approaches: explore both convergences and differences in beginning to consider – fundamentally, what are some of the central processes of change in psychotherapy?
* Cultural considerations in the treatment process.

**Prerequisites:**

Graduate or Continuing Education student status.

Prior undergraduate and/or graduate coursework in psychology is preferred, but not required.

**Required Reading:**

Textbook:

Messer, S. B., & Gurman, A. S. (2020). *Essential psychotherapies* (Fourth Edition). NY:

Guilford.

(Available as an ebook through the Gottesman Library at Teachers College. Relevant chapters are added into Canvas. Or you may purchase the book.)

Journal Articles:

All journal articles are linked on Canvas unless otherwise indicated.

**Course Requirements and Breakdown of Grades:**

**30% - Class Participation (100 points)**

Participation includes attending class weekly, emailing course assistant when you’ll be late, emailing course assistant when you will miss class, and engaging in discussions.

Please come to class prepared by having thoroughly and thoughtfully completed the readings and assignments to engage in group discussion. Most classes will have required readings, as well as optional readings or assignments. Throughout lectures, students will either engage in a whole-class or small-group discussions.

**40% - Reaction Papers (100 points)**

You will write **5** reaction papers on the various psychotherapies we discuss in class using the prompts listed below.

1. According to class discussions and your readings, what do you think are important components of effective psychotherapy. What traits are important to becoming an effective psychotherapist? In your opinion, what is it about psychotherapy that makes it an opportunity to alleviate suffering in people?
2. Thinking about the historical developmental of psychoanalysis and the subsequent evolution of psychodynamic psychotherapy, what continues to make this an effective treatment? Has it changed enough to be considered evidence-based? Do behavioral approaches compensate for what dynamic approaches are missing?
3. Cognitive behavioral therapy and the subsequent waves of psychotherapies pushed back against dynamic approaches, but CBT, although very effective in treating mild symptoms, still did not address treat all diagnoses. How effective are subsequent waves of CBT in address the inadequacies of CBT (i.e. DBT and suicidal behavior)? What makes these techniques more effective than CBT?
4. How do non-directive therapies feel to you? How would someone struggling with symptoms of depression or making decision feel when the therapist does not give specific guidance? How effective are these therapies?
5. When considering cultural and identity as important factors of psychotherapy, how are current psychotherapies addressing these factors? Do these modalities need to learn to accommodate people from diverse backgrounds and identities OR do we need to develop newer therapies that integrate diversity and multicultural identities?

Please submit your reaction papers (about 500 words, or 1-2 pages, Times New Roman or Calibri, size 11 or 12 font, double spaced, with 1” margins) to Canvas. Include your name, date, and a title (e.g. Reaction Paper #1) in the file name.

Reaction papers should be written in the first person. They do not need to include formal citations or have the scholarly tone that you might use in a research paper, or in other academic work. Grades are based on how well you integrate the course material (e.g. lecture, readings, and discussions). Personal reflections will not be graded but are a welcome addition to your synthesis of the course material to illustrate your ideas. Critical thinking and deep reflection are important components of these reflections. Please do not simply summarize the material!

**30% - Comparative Case Conceptualization: 12/22/2022**

Students will be writing a comparative case conceptualization, where students will use a case to compare and contrast **two theoretical orientations** to explain how symptoms developed, how to effectively treat symptoms and improve functioning, and what continues to reinforce symptoms in the person. Students may choose a case from the list provided on Canvas, use a current/former case (deidentified), movie character, or personal acquaintance (deidentified) to develop a case conceptualization. Students will write a biopsychosocial background on the patient, possible diagnoses, and effective treatments.

Details of the case conceptualization will be provided with examples during week 6 of class. I will post examples on Canvas as well as detailed description of the assignment.

**COURSE POLICIES**

1. **Class Attendance** - A significant portion of the grade in this class is based on class discussion and participation. The expectation is that you will attend all classes and participate in an active way. Missing classes will affect your class participation grade. If you are unable to attend live sessions, need to miss a live class due to illness or other emergency, or need to be tardy, please reach out to me using the contact information listed in the syllabus or the course assistant. Please contact me prior to class if you will not attend or will be late. For religious observation, please send me a message letting me know you will miss class.

If you miss a class discussion, you will have to submit a one-paragraph reflection of the readings for that class to receive credit for participation.

1. **Cell Phone Policy** - Please turn off or silence cell phones. The use of cell phones and other mobile devices during class is a distraction, irritation, and sign of disrespect to everyone. A short break will be provided mid-class, during which you may check mobile devices.
2. **Due Dates** - All assignments will be due at the time specified in the syllabus. If you have trouble completing an assignment on time, you should contact me by **noon the day before the assignment is due** and you will be provided with an additional day to complete the assignment. There are **NO** extensions provided for the case conceptualizations because it is due on the last day of class.
3. **Grading Policy** - Grades will be based on the compilation of points gained from each of the requirements, with 100 points being the maximum. Evaluations are based on 100 points:

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| A+ | 97-100 | B- | 81-83 |
| A | 93-96 | C+ | 78-80 |
| A- | 90-92 | C | 75-77 |
| B+ | 87-89 | C- | 71-74 |
| B | 84-86 | F | 70 and below |

1. **Communication with the Instructor** – I am happy to correspond between classes via

e-mail. I will respond to e-mails and calls as soon as possible. To facilitate this process, in e-mails, please include CCPX 4038 at the beginning of the subject line. I highly encourage you to reach out to me in case of an absence or tardiness.

**TC POLICIES**

1. **Accommodations** – The College will make reasonable accommodations for persons with documented disabilities. Students are encouraged to contact the Office of Access and Services for Individuals with Disabilities (OASID) for information about registration. You can reach OASID by email at oasid@tc.columbia.edu, stop by 301 Zankel Building or call 212-678-3689. Services are available only to students who have registered and submit appropriate documentation.  As your instructor, I am happy to discuss specific needs with you as well.  Please report any access related concerns about instructional material to OASID and to me as your instructor.
2. **Incomplete Grades** – For the full text of the Incomplete Grade policy please refer to [http://www.tc.columbia.edu/policylibrary/Incomplete Grades](http://www.tc.columbia.edu/policylibrary/Incomplete%20Grades)
3. **Student Responsibility for Monitoring TC email account**– Students are expected to monitor their TC email accounts. For the full text of the Student Responsibility for Monitoring TC email account please refer to [http://www.tc.columbia.edu/policylibrary/Student Responsibility for Monitoring TC Email Account](http://www.tc.columbia.edu/policylibrary/Student%20Responsibility%20for%20Monitoring%20TC%20Email%20Account)
4. **Religious Observance**– For the full text of the Religious Observance policy, please refer to <http://www.tc.columbia.edu/policylibrary/provost/religious-observance/>
5. **Sexual Harassment and Violence Reporting** – Teachers College is committed to maintaining a safe environment for students. Because of this commitment and because of federal and state regulations, we must advise you that if you tell any of your instructors about sexual harassment or gender-based misconduct involving a member of the campus community, your instructor is required to report this information to the Title IX Coordinator, Janice Robinson.  She will treat this information as private, but will need to follow up with you and possibly look into the matter.  The Ombuds Officer is a confidential resource available for students, staff and faculty, including matters concerning “Gender-based Misconduct”. “Gender-based misconduct” includes sexual assault, stalking, sexual harassment, dating violence, domestic violence, sexual exploitation, and gender-based harassment.  For more information, see <http://sexualrespect.columbia.edu/gender-based-misconduct-policy-students>. The TC Ombuds Officer may be reached at [ombuds@tc.columbia.edu](mailto:ombuds@tc.columbia.edu) or 212-678-4169.
6. **Emergency Plan** – TC is prepared for a wide range of emergencies. After declaring an emergency situation, the President/Provost will provide the community with critical information on procedures and available assistance. If travel to campus is not feasible, instructors will facilitate academic continuity through Canvas and other technologies, if possible.
7. It is the student’s responsibility to ensure that they are set to receive email notifications from TC and communications from their instructor at their TC email address.
8. Within the first two sessions for the course, students are expected to review and be prepared to follow the instructions stated in the emergency plan.
9. The plan may consist of downloading or obtaining all available readings for the course or the instructor may provide other instructions.
10. **Academic Integrity** - Students who intentionally submit work either not their own or without clear attribution to the original source, fabricate data or other information, engage in cheating, or misrepresentation of academic records may be subject to charges. Sanctions may include dismissal from the college for violation of the TC principles of academic and professional integrity fundamental to the purpose of the College.

**COURSE SCHEDULE**

\*\*Lecture topics might slightly change depending on guest lecturer availability\*\*

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Class | Date | Topic of Discussion | Assignments Due |
| 1 | Sept 8 | Introduction to course; Psychotherapies Overview |  |
| 2 | Sept 15 | Common Elements of Psychotherapy – History |  |
| 3 | Sept 22 | Effectiveness of Psychotherapy |  |
| 4 | Sept 29 | Psychodynamic Psychotherapy | **Reaction Paper #1 Due** |
| 5 | Oct 6 | Psychodynamic – Group Work - Video |  |
| 6 | Oct 13 | Psychoanalysis – Guest Speaker |  |
| 7 | Oct 20 | Case Conceptualization – Theoretical Orientation – Cultural Formulations | **Reaction Paper #2 Due** |
| 8 | Oct 27 | Behavioral Therapy / Cognitive Behavioral Therapy / MBCT - MBSR |  |
| 9 | Nov 3 | ACT –Dialectical Behavioral Therapy | **Reaction Paper #3 Due** |
| 10 | Nov 10 | Child Trauma Treatment |  |
| 11 | Nov 17 | Humanistic-Existential Psychotherapy | **Reaction Paper #4 Due** |
| NO | **CLASS** | **ON NOVEMBER 24th** |  |
| 12 | Dec 1 | Emotion-Focused Therapy – Tentative Guest Speaker |  |
| 13 | Dec 8 | Interpersonal Psychotherapy – Guest Speaker |  |
| 14 | Dec 15 | Multicultural Psychotherapies | **Reaction Paper #5 Due** |
| 15 | Dec 22 | Final Reflections – Integrative Approaches | **Comparative Case Conceptualization Due** |

**DETAILED COURSE SCHEDULE**

**CLASS 1: 09/08/2022**

**Introduction to the Course – Instructor and Student Introductions – Basic Overview of Psychotherapy**

Elliott R., Bohart, A.C., Watson, J.C., & Greenberg LS. (2011). Empathy. Psychotherapy, 48. 43-49.

Recognition of psychotherapy effectiveness. (2012, August). Retrieved from

http://www.apa.org/about/policy/resolution-psychotherapy.aspx

Prochaska, J. O., Norcross, J. C., & DiClemente, C. C. (2013). Applying the stages of change. In *Psychologists' desk reference, 3rd ed.* (pp. 176-181). New York, NY, US: Oxford University Press.

**CLASS 2: 09/16/2022**

**Common Elements of Psychotherapy – History of Talk Therapy**

Cuijpers, P., Reijnders, M., & Huibers, M. J. H. (2019). The Role of Common Factors in Psychotherapy Outcomes. *Annu Rev Clin Psychol, 15*, 207-231. doi:10.1146/annurev-clinpsy-050718-095424

Wampold, B. E., Hollon, S. D., & Hill, C. E. (2011). Unresolved questions and future directions in psychotherapy research. In *History of psychotherapy: Continuity and change, 2nd ed.* (pp. 333-356). Washington, DC, US: American Psychological Association.

**CLASS 3: 09/22/2022**

**Effectiveness of Psychotherapy – What makes it work?**

Hunsley, J., Elliott, K. & Therrien, Z. (2013, September 10). *The efficacy and effectiveness of psychological treatments*. Retrieved from http://www.cpa.ca/docs/File/Practice/TheEfficacyAndEffectivenessOfPsychologicalTreatments\_web.pdf

Three Therapeutic Perspectives:

Interpersonal Psychotherapy: Huey Jing Renee, T (2020). An illustration of interpersonal psychotherapy for perinatal depression. *Case Reports in Psychiatry. 2020: 1-37.* <https://doi.org/10.1155/2020/8820849>

Psychodynamic Psychotherapy: <http://www.psychotherapy.net/data/uploads/52315fd6bb78d.pdf> (pages 16-77).

Cognitive Behavioral Therapy: <https://ryecast.ryerson.ca/Content/attachments/Archive/5515/IPE-CBT_CBT_Simulation_with_Julie_Beginning_(Session_1).pdf>

**CLASS 4: 09/29/2022**

**Psychodynamic/Psychoanalytic Psychotherapy**

Messer & Gurman – Chapters 1 and 2

Shedler, J. (2010). The efficacy of psychodynamic psychotherapy. *American psychologist*, *65*(2), 98.

**CLASS 5: 10/06/2022**

**Psychoanalysis**

Messer & Gurman – Chapter 3

McWilliams, N. (2005). Preserving our humanity as therapists.  *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice & Training, 42,* 139-151.

Markin, R. D. (2014). Toward a common identity for relationally oriented clinicians. *Psychotherapy, 51*, 327-333.

**CLASS 6: 10/13/2022**

**Case Conceptualizations – Theoretical Orientations – Cultural Formulations**

Case Conceptualization - https://ct.counseling.org/2020/12/case-conceptualization-key-to-highly-effective-counseling/

Hagmayer, Y., Witteman, C., & Claes, L. (2021). PACT: A protocol for assessment, mechanism‐based case formulation and treatment planning. *Journal of Evaluation in Clinical Practice*.

Ertl, M. M., Mann-Saumier, M., Martin, R. A., Graves, D. F., & Altarriba, J. (2019). The Impossibility of Client–Therapist “Match”: Implications and Future Directions for Multicultural Competency. *Journal of Mental Health Counseling*, *41*(4), 312-326.

Tehee M., Isaacs D., Domenech Rodríguez M.M. (2020) The Elusive Construct of Cultural Competence. In: Benuto L., Gonzalez F., Singer J. (eds) Handbook of Cultural Factors in Behavioral Health. Springer, Cham. <https://doi-org.ezproxy.cul.columbia.edu/10.1007/978-3-030-32229-8_2>

APA Examples of Applying Interventions: <https://www.apa.org/depression-guideline/case-examples>

**CLASS 7: 10/20/2022**

**Behavioral Therapy/ Cognitive Behavioral Therapy**

Messer & Gurman – Chapter 4 & 5

Butryn, M.L., Webb, V., & Wadden, T.A. (2011). Behavioral treatment of obesity. *Psychiatric Clinics of North America 34(4), 841-859.*

Goldfried, M.R., Raue, P.J., & Castonguay, L.G. (1998).  The therapeutic focus in significant sessions of master therapists: A comparison of cognitive-behavioral and psychodynamic-interpersonal interventions. *Journal of Consulting and Clinical Psychology, 66*, 803-811.

Hofmann, S. et al. (2012). The efficacy of cognitive behavioral therapy: a review of meta-analyses. *Cognitive Therapy Research,* 36(5), 427-440.

**CLASS 8: 10/27/2022**

**Third Wave CBT – ACT/MBCT/MBSR**

Messer & Gurman – Chapter 6

Hayes, S. C. (2004). Acceptance and commitment therapy, relational frame theory, and the third wave of behavioral and cognitive therapies. *Behavior Therapy, 35*, 638-665.

Hofmann, S. G., & Asmundson, G. J. (2008). Acceptance and mindfulness-based therapy: New wave or old hat? *Clinical Psychology Review, 28*(1), 2-16.

Davis, D.M., & Hayes, J. A. (2011). What are the benefits of mindfulness? A practice review of psychotherapy-related research. *Psychotherapy, 48*, 2, 198-208.

**CLASS 9: 11/3/2022**

**Dialectical Behavioral Therapy**

Carey, B. (2011, June 23). Expert on mental illness reveals her own fight. *The New York Times*. [www.nytimes.com/2011/06/23/health/23lives.html](http://www.nytimes.com/2011/06/23/health/23lives.html).

What is Dialectical Behavior Therapy? <https://behavioraltech.org/resources/faqs/dialectical-behavior-therapy-dbt/>

Burckell, L. A., & McMain, S. (2011). Contrasting clients in Dialectical Behavior Therapy for borderline personality disorder: “Marie” and “Dean,” two cases with different alliance trajectories & outcomes. *Pragmatic Case Studies in Psychotherapy, 7*, 246-267. http://pcsp.libraries.rutgers.edu.

**CLASS 10: 11/10/2022**

**Child Trauma Treatment**

**Will add shortly**

**CLASS 11: 11/17/2022**

**Humanistic-Existential Psychotherapy**

Messer & Gurman – Chapters 8

Rogers, C. R. (1957). The necessary and sufficient conditions of therapeutic personality change. *Journal of Counseling Psychology, 21*, 95-103.

Farber, B. A. (2007). On the enduring and substantial influence of Carl Rogers’ not-quite essential nor necessary conditions. *Psychotherapy: Theory, Research, Practice, and Training*, *44*, 289-294.

**CLASS 12: 12/01/2022**

**Emotion-Focused Psychotherapy**

Messer & Gurman – Chapters 7

Greenberg, L. S. (2004). Emotion-focused therapy. *Clinical Psychology and Psychotherapy, 11*, 3-16.

Goldman, R. N. (2017). The emotion-focused therapeutic relationship: Genuineness, warmth, and acceptance are not neutral: Comment on Gelso and Kanninen (2017). Journal of Psychotherapy Integration, 27, 350-35.

**CLASS 13: 12/08/2022**

**Interpersonal Psychotherapy**

Messer & Gurman – Chapters 12

Markowitz, J.C. & Weissman, M. (2004). Interpersonal psychotherapy: principles and applications. *World Psychiatry.* 3 (3): 136-139.

Rose-Clarke, K., Pradhan, I., Shrestha, P., BK, P., Magar, J., Luitel, N. P., ... & Verdeli, H. (2020). Culturally and developmentally adapting group interpersonal therapy for adolescents with depression in rural Nepal. *BMC psychology*, *8*(1), 1-15.

**CLASS 14: 12/15/2022**

**Multicultural Psychotherapies**

Comas-Díaz, L. (2014). Multicultural psychotherapy. In *APA handbook of multicultural psychology, Vol. 2: Applications and training.* (pp. 419-441). Washington, DC, US: American Psychological Association.

Davis, D. E., DeBlaere, C., Owen, J., Hook, J. N., Rivera, D. P., Choe, E., ... & Placeres, V. (2018). The multicultural orientation framework: A narrative review. *Psychotherapy*, *55*(1), 89

The Therapy Relationship in Multicultural Psychotherapy - <https://societyforpsychotherapy.org/the-therapy-relationship-in-multicultural-psychotherapy/>

**CLASS 15: 12/22/2022 \*\*Case Conceptualization Due\*\***

**Final Reflections and Integrate Knowledge**

No readings